Migration Letters

Volume: 21, No: 4, pp. 1645-1655

ISSN: 1741-8984 (Print) ISSN: 1741-8992 (Online)
www.migrationletters.com

Development of Blended History Learning Model on Critical Thinking in Digital History Literacy

Septina Alrianingrum[1], Yatim Riyanto[2], Bachtiar S. Bachri[3], Fajar Arianto[4]

Abstract

This study aims to identify the effectiveness of development blended history learning model on students' critical thinking on digital history literacy. This research uses the Dick and Carey development design which has ten steps. The research sample amounted to 124 participants in this development research. The research was conducted at the history education study program of Surabaya State University. The data in this study were collected using a questionnaire method. The questionnaire was given at pretest and posttest. This method is used to determine the needs analysis of the questionnaire method or questionnaire method used to determine the critical thinking of participants. Data analysis techniques using the Paired Sample T Test. The analysis results obtained a value of 0.000 <0.05 which indicates a statistically significant effectiveness. In conclusion, the application of blended history learning model development is effective in improving students' critical thinking on digital history literacy.

Keywords: *Blended Learning, History Learning, Critical Thinking.*

Introduction

The development of technology in various aspects of human life is accelerating and facilitating the need for lifelong learning. Digitalization to artificial intelligence (AI) has controlled almost all aspects of human life. The dynamics of disruption as a result of the industrial revolution 4.0 to the era of society 5.0 has the potential to minimize the role of humans, so it needs to be synergized to form humans who are Smart Society 5.0 Hybrid based learning activities and digital literacy skills in the teaching and learning process become a new learning style in the era of society 5.0 and 21st century education. These learning activities are used to facilitate students' difficulties in (1) understanding the assigned tasks, (2) finding ideas based on certain topics, (3) obtaining varied sources of information in order to use different sources or formats, (4) using internet search engines and understanding the credibility of websites, (5) citing a copyrighted source directly or indirectly to avoid plagiarism, and (6) learning new things in an active and creative way.

Access to these digital information resources is imperative given that the volume of information in electronic format (digital literacy) available is estimated to far exceed the information available in printed format. As a result, the new paradigm learning process must utilize digital information. Educators function more as facilitators, trainers, mentors and companions of learners who are experiencing the learning process. In fact, educators and learners can learn and study together through the interactions that exist between them

[1] Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia
[2] Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia
[3] State University of Surabaya, Indonesia
[4] State University of Surabaya, Indonesia

when discussing a particular material through various digital learning resources. The role of educators is no longer the center of learning because students can directly access the sources of knowledge that have been disseminated or distributed by educators in the classroom (Yogyantoro, 2022). Students' learning style will be affected by digital expertise in learning. Frequent use of digital technology will make students' digital knowledge better (Arono et al., 2022).

Digital literacy skills are very important for students to have to support the teaching materials delivered by educators. Digital literacy is the skill of processing information from information and communication technology sources around students to improve the quality of learning and education. Digital literacy includes necessary skills such as accessing accurate information using various technology products, producing and sharing information, and using technology in the most efficient way in the teaching-learning process (Taşkıran & Salur, 2021). The digital literacy framework describes the skills needed to access, use, interpret and design multimodal content mediated by the Internet (Nguyen et al., 2022). Digital literacy is defined as the intellectual and technical skills that enable learners to use communication technology resources to find, analyze, evaluate, and create educational content (Zahran, 2023).

The reality of history learning at various school levels tends to only utilize historical facts as the main material, so that learning feels dry, uninteresting, and does not provide opportunities for students to learn to understand a concept from a historical event. History learning is often considered as boring and monotonous learning, encouraging in general that the history learning process is still static and conventional. There are no changes made by history teachers from time to time using only conventional methods such as the lecture method which only reads or repeats sentences in the book. Learners only have learning experiences such as listening, recording and memorizing material presented by educators. This requires the need for a thought to create a learning strategy or model that is innovative, creative, direct learning and contains a critical thinking process through the what pattern, who, where, when, why, how or better known as 5W1H.

The findings of these problems, the blended learning model can be used as a learning model solution that can accommodate problems in history learning, utilize information sources from information and communication technology, access to learning without time and place limitations, make students active, increase curiosity and interest in learning and provide a new atmosphere in effective and efficient learning activities. This learning development is called blended history learning. The purpose of this development research is to develop students' historical literacy skills based on digital information by applying a blended history learning model, it is hoped that after having this skill, students' critical thinking will develop and increase in their learning activities.

Literature Review

Blended Learning

Blended learning is a learning approach that integrates offline face-to-face classical-traditional learning with online distance learning. The learning resources used in this learning process have various choices and establish communication between students and other educators. The diversity of learning resources in the form of digital and non-digital learning resources becomes the color of blended learning as a learning system. Graham (2006) describes blended learning as a type of learning that involves a combination of online learning and face-to-face learning. In this context, learners are directed to carry out independent learning activities in class, as well as interactive group learning activities for the purpose of developing higher order thinking skills (Noroozi, 2022). Blended learning is a learning method that combines face-to-face instruction provided during class with online education provided outside of class hours by using synchronous and/or

asynchronous digital technologies (Kemaloglu & Bayyurt, 2022). Blended learning is a teaching model that effectively integrates face-to-face teaching and computer-assisted online learning, and creates learning through carefully designed physical activities and virtual performance parts (Wuxue, 2023).

This model can be implemented not only during the face-to-face learning process, but also during activities beyond face-to-face activities either at school, at home, or in other places that have internet access. Blended learning will increase student-teacher interaction and student-student interaction. student-teacher and student-student interaction, as well as provide a more dynamic and interactive learning environment, more dynamic and interactive, which leads to a better participation rate (Setiawan et al., 2022). Blended learning is a method that combines e-learning and face-to-face classes in the process of learning activities (Kobayashi et al., 2023). The implementation of blended learning does not only combine face-to-face learning with online learning, but requires the most appropriate combination. This combination can be managed well by deeply understanding the conceptual models and practices of effective blended learning arrangements. The recommendation of blended learning arrangement can be seen from the synchronization perspective of time and space (Nurrijal et al., 2023). The blended learning conceptual model aims to form a stronger community to interact, discuss, and share ideas and can stimulate students' independent learning pace both synchronously and asynchronously.(Lin & Gao, 2020). The most important purpose of blended learning is to bring together the strengths of these two different environments and offer active, purposeful and flexible learning opportunities for students (Bedebayeva et al., 2022)

There are several types of blended learning models often mentioned by many expert researchers, these models are very important to conduct effective teaching activities. But, teachers can choose the context-appropriate blended learning model to manage the classroom in order to provide a more effective learning environment. According to Horn and Staker (2011), there are six blended learning models: Face-to-Face Driver Model, Rotation Model, Flexibility Model, Online Lab Model, Self-Paced Blended Model, and Online Driver Model. The Face-to-Face Instructor Model is the most similar to the conventional school framework. This model allows for the introduction of online education on a case-by-case basis, meaning that only a portion of the students in the class will engage in any kind of blended learning. The Rotation Model uses a fixed schedule to talk to their instructors face-to-face and then switch to an online learning environment. The Flexibility model is focused on heavy online training. Instructors work as facilitators rather than instruction providers. The Online Lab model includes learners who log in and attend school for the entire course with fully online instruction. No licensed professors are available, but instead, qualified professionals supervise them. The Self-Paced Blended model is used for more classes in one school or district in a conventional setting. Learners take part in lectures but then take courses to accompany their usual program of study. The Online Driver Model is the opposite of the traditional face-to-face instructional paradigm. Learners work from remote areas, from their homes, and receive the entire suite of learning (Katasila & Poonpon, 2022). Another major model of blended learning is the flex model. In the flex model, online learning is the backbone of student learning while face-to-face education has a supporting role. In this model, students have more flexibility in making decisions about their own learning. In the A La Carte model, students take some courses of their choice through distance education as well as face-to-face education. In this way, students continue some of their courses entirely online, and some courses entirely face-to-face. Finally, in the enriched virtual model, while students take all their courses online, they use face-to-face training only for support purposes. This blended learning model has the least influence on face-to-face education (Bursa, 2023).

There are many advantages of this blended learning model in learning activities, including providing easy access to various learning resources without any restrictions, learning time can be anywhere and anytime, can follow the learning needs of students

according to their learning styles, providing a new atmosphere in learning, improving the quality of learning, integrated learning with information communication technology with internet media, developing students' digital literacy and making it easier to achieve the learning objectives to be achieved. Learners in the blended learning model can demonstrate their ability to reflect on themselves socially and academically in the environment as well as in face-to-face learning. The blended learning model facilitates learners to improve their skills in using various information technologies, and enables individuals to make progress to become technologically literate (Cleveland-Innes & Wilton, 2018). The blended learning environment should facilitate engagement and experience and also encourage student participation in learning.(Armellini et al., 2021). Blended learning is formal education where a student engages through online learning with some element of student control over location, path, pace, and time; modalities along each student's learning path connected to provide an integrated learning experience (Mutya & Masuhay, 2023).

History Learning

History learning is learning that contains information about various kinds of past or previous events that have a lot of content of knowledge, information, wisdom, heritage, values, lessons and others that are required for students to know. So that they always learn what past events they can take positive values as provisions and guidelines through life in the present. History learning is not merely remembering an event, name, place, number and year. However, history is a fact that provides awareness or raises consciousness. Learning history is not just about remembering events, names, places, numbers and years. However, history is a fact that provides awareness or raises historical awareness in children (Efendi et al., 2021). History learning actually has a very important role in building the nation's character, developing students' activities to examine various events, to then understand and internalise the various values behind the event so as to give birth to examples to behave and then act (Permana, 2020). History learning is one of the important and interesting subjects to learn because it has a very important role in building the character of students. In addition, history learning also contributes to the formation of a nation's identity. Knowledge of the past must contain wisdom values that are useful for training intelligence, developing attitudes, character, and building the personality of learners (Afwan et al., 2020).

Although, history learning materially discusses events that have occurred in the past, it is actually the current events that will become the subject of history learning. events that have occurred in the past, but actually at this time the events that will become history in the future are happening. History in the future is happening. In history, it is known that there is a pattern of history that can be repeated (Amboro, 2020). History learning that demands historical thinking skills that should be developed by history teachers has not been implemented effectively (Maxwell, 2019). In learning history, there are several skills that must be developed by every history teacher, namely historical thinking skills. These skills are in line with the demands of the 21st century. Historical thinking skills are skills that must be possessed by students when they learn history in the hope that they can make students think more critically in answering every historical reality that has happened (Pratama et al., 2022).

Effective and proper history learning will provide certain meanings and benefits, especially regarding students' understanding and awareness of history so that the instructional design of history learning itself is needed. Designing history learning is not easy, because it must determine the learning needs of students, besides that it must also focus on the transformation of the logical meaning of knowledge into psychological meaning by considering the abilities and conditions of students so that it runs optimally in the implementation of learning (Fadli & Sudrajat, 2020). More specifically in history learning, the preparation must also consider the characteristics of history learning, if the goal is for students to understand and appreciate the values contained in each historical

event, then the design can express these values so that they can be understood by students. In learning history, it does not only provide historical knowledge but also aims to awaken students or raise historical awareness so that in the learning process it needs to promote life values, not just memorizing names, places, events and numbers (Fadli et al., 2021).

The purpose of learning history is ideally to help students achieve the following abilities: (1) understanding the past in the context of the present, (2) developing interest in a meaningful past, (3) helping to understand the identity of oneself, family, community and nation, (4) helping to understand cultural roots and their interrelationship with various aspects of real life, (5) providing knowledge and understanding of other countries and cultures in various parts of the world, (6) training in inquiry and problem solving, (7) introduce scientific thinking patterns of historical scientists, and (8) prepare students for higher education (Permana, 2020). The purpose of learning history in the current era of globalisation should be to prepare students with quality and character. Learning history for students is very important because it can help them to think more critically and wisely, and be able to understand the meaning and value of each past event to prepare for the future, not just remembering figures, facts and years. Thus, the purpose of learning history is not limited to the cognitive domain (knowledge) but can reach the psychomotor domain in the process of forming the character of students (Sopacua et al., 2020).

Critical Thinking

Critical thinking is the art of analysing and evaluating to improve thinking, critical thinking can also be referred to as a set of skills to analyse facts, generate and organise ideas, compare, draw conclusions, evaluate arguments, and solve problems, many definitions explain about this skill. Critical thinking can be defined as a reflective, reasonable, and functional way of thinking used by individuals when deciding what to believe or what to do, and critical thinking is not only about cognitive skills but also some dispositions such as being innovative, confident, open-minded, objective, or willing to seek the truth (Orhan, 2023). Critical thinking is a reflective and rational thinking process, one of the higher-order thinking that should be at the centre of learning development because it makes humans have the life skills, creativity and innovation to face complex real-life problems (Sutoyo et al., 2023). Critical thinking is a way of thinking in which prejudices, assumptions, and knowledge are tested, evaluated, and assessed and their various aspects, extensions, meanings, and consequences are discussed, ideas are analysed and evaluated, reasoning, logic, and comparison are used, resulting in a particular idea, theory, or behavior (Kizilhan & Demir, 2022) .

Critical thinking is a clear and purposeful process used in activities such as problem solving, decision making, persuasion, analysing assumptions, and conducting scientific research. Those who think critically can summarise their knowledge, understand how to use information to solve problems, and search for relevant sources of information to support problem solving. Critical thinking is a reflective ability; students need this skill to deal with a variety of personal and social problems (Patandung, 2023). Someone who has critical thinking skills will have careful consideration to gather various evidence/information before making a decision or establishing a position (Saputro et al., 2022). Critical thinking consists of various interconnected thinking components, the requirements of critical thinking include clarity, precision, logic, rigour, importance, fairness, depth, breadth, and accuracy (Huang & Chang, 2022). Critical thinking methods require individual learner competence to interpret, analyse, evaluate, rationalise and investigate data. Then critical thinking tactics involve problem recognition, analysing facts and evidence, and questioning sources of information. In other words, the critical thinking approach uses information and observations that have been verified (Wei, 2023).

The habit of critical thinking in education is required to be implemented and realised in learning activities, so that students can be trained and accustomed to be sensitive to

events, information, news and even problems around them for them to process everything with their analysis and reasoning to determine a good, appropriate, suitable, relevant to the situation and can be accounted for. With critical thinking being part of education, it can be said that students become more academically successful and more helpful, positive and socially sensitive (Temel, 2022). The importance of critical thinking is increasing along with efforts to develop students' creativity, independence, and scientific thinking (Arisoy & Aybek, 2021). Educational institutions should encourage their students to learn, think, and reason critically, required to contribute to the development of critical thinking skills because in this educational context, one is expected to be able to increase their cognitive potential and motivation to reflexively construct their knowledge in a critical, autonomous, proactive, independent, and continuous manner (Morais et al., 2023). The importance of critical thinking as an essential skill and its development is undeniable in today's educational environment (Vachova et al., 2023).

Research Design

The development research conducted in the process uses the Dick and Carey development model. The development model developed refers to the learning design of Dick & Carey revised in 2015 developed by Walter Dick, Lou Carey and James O Carey this is a procedural model whose steps must be implemented sequentially in ten stages. this development research contains several stages used to design and develop a learning model called Blended Historical Learning. The main steps of the learning system design model according to Dick & Carey are (1) identifying the instructional goals, (2) conduct instructional analysis, (3) analyze learners and context, (4) write performance objectives, (5) develop assessment instrument, (6) develop assessment strategy (7) develop and select instructional materials, (8) design and conduct formative evaluation of instruction, (9) revise instruction, and (10) develop and conduct summative evaluation.

There were 124 participants in this development research. The research was conducted at the history education study program of Surabaya State University. The time of this development research was carried out around four months. The indicators of critical thinking skills used in this research consist of six indicators, namely (1) Interpretation, (2) Analysis, (3) Evaluation, (4) Conclusion/Inference, (5) Explanation, and (6) Self-regulation (Facione, 2015). The data in this study were collected using a questionnaire method. The questionnaire was given at pretest and posttest. This method is used to determine the needs analysis of the questionnaire method or questionnaire method used to determine the critical thinking of participants. Data analysis techniques using the Paired Sample T Test.

Findings

After the data is collected and then obtaining valid and reliable results, then knowing the results of the application of the blended history learning model development on critical thinking is described as below.

Table 1. Average Pretest and Posttest

Paired Samples Statistics

		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	Pre_Test	5.96	124	1.749	.157
	Pos_Test	8.46	124	1.979	.178

Based on Table 1, the results of data analysis show a summary of the results of the descriptive statistics of both pre-test and post-test samples. The average pretest score is 5.96 while the post test is 8.46. Because the pretest learning outcome is 5.96 < Post Test

8.46, it means that descriptively there is a difference in the average learning outcome after being given a post test. In proving the truth or reality of this difference through significant or not.

Tabel 2. Correlations Paired Sample

Paired Samples Correlations

		N	Correlation	Sig.
Pair 1	Pre_Test & Pos_Test	124	.031	.736

Based on Table 2, the significance value is 0.736> 0.05, so it can be said that there is an influence after giving the post test. Then test the hypothesis through paired samples t test.

Tabel 3. Paired Sample T Test

Paired Samples Test

		Paired Differences					t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference Lower	Upper			
Pair 1	Pre_Test - Pos_Test	-2.505	2.601	.234	-2.967	-2.043	-10.727	123	.000

Based on Table 3, shows the paired samples t test data above known sig value (2 tailed) is 0.00 <0.05, it can be concluded that Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted. Thus, it is known that there is a difference in the average student learning outcomes between the pre-test and after being given the post-test, which means that there is an effect of applying the blended history learning model on participants' critical thinking.

Discussion

Based on the results of data analysis, it was found that the application of the blended history learning model had an effect on participants' critical thinking. This is based on the results of the paired sample t test on posttest data obtained a significance value of 0.00 <0.05. The impact of the application of this model is supported by the advantages possessed by blended history learning. the combination of learning that has been integrated with information and communication technology connected to the internet provides convenience for students in history learning activities.

The advantages of blended history learning model cannot be separated from the advantages offered by the blended learning model itself. So many benefits are provided in the learning process, especially in history learning which needs a lot of time to process information both in the past and the future in order to get accurate, relevant, connected and comprehensive information. Easy access to information from various literacy sources without time and space limitations, extensive communication between students and educators, training independent learning, facilitating the learning process of students according to their learning style and many others. Blended learning can improve student engagement and learning outcomes, as well as provide access and flexibility to student learning, and potentially reduce costs. Blended learning can help students develop important knowledge and skills, including communication, collaboration, critical thinking, and creativity, which will be necessary for their future success (Graham, 2019). Blended learning provides convenience for students who combine work, family, and who live in remote areas, or who have special learning needs. Reduced classroom contact hours with learning materials, assessments, and guidance delivered online is a convenience for learners (Fuller, 2021). The blended learning model is also maintained to

support students to become lifelong learners with the ability to learn continuously outside of the classroom and manage their own learning process (Kemaloglu & Bayyurt, 2022). Providing online resources and online materials in a classroom environment, all students have access to the same educational opportunities (Kömür et al., 2023).

The advantages of blended learning are proven to provide many benefits effectively and efficiently in the world of education, various materials in various subjects can use this learning model in its implementation. The limitless freedom of time in understanding such diverse materials from textbooks or online materials is very useful in enhancing the quality of students' understanding. The blended learning approach has established modernization, flexibility, liveliness, and association in the teaching and learning process. Through blended learning, learners can use online anytime and anywhere. Blended learning can effectively combine various deployment approaches, educational models, and learning styles (Indra et al., 2022). The blended learning approach proves beneficial when studying extensive material as a portion of the material can be processed through online activities, allowing the time allocated for schoolwork to be completed with additional clarification and active discussion (Radulović et al., 2023). Blended learning is an important component of modern schooling, which provides flexibility and convenience for students by integrating regular learning with e-learning using computers and the Internet and conducted in the classroom or on the Internet (Al-Azzam et al., 2023). Blended learning is flexible and effective and helps all parties to learn, also suitable for students in education through using mobile phones or personal computers, direct communication between teachers and students, and interaction with peers (Ayasrah et al., 2022).

The results of this study have similarities with the results of previous studies. The results of this study show that the application of blended-PBL is able to train students to improve their critical thinking skills in terms of how to answer the tests given (Lukitasari et al., 2019). The results showed that blended learning in improving students' critical thinking (Hasanah & Malik, 2020). The results of this study indicate that history learning activities with blended learning models provide effectiveness in the learning process (Suwarni, 2021). The results showed a statistically significant difference in critical thinking in favor of the experimental group who had studied with blended learning in history subject (Othman & AL-Hileh, 2022).

Conclusion

The results of the research discussion regarding the development of a blended history learning model provide a statistically effective increase in participants' critical thinking. Thus, the blended history learning model can be an alternative learning model to improve critical thinking in learning activities in digital historical literacy.

Acknowledgment

The researcher would like to thank the supervisor Prof. Dr. Yatim Riyanto, M.Pd and Dr. Bachtiar S. Bachri, M.Pd. who have guided the research and preparation of this article

References

Afwan, B., Suryani, N., & Ardianto, D. T. (2020). Analisis Kebutuhan Pembelajaran Sejarah Di Era Digital. Proceding Literasi Dalam Pendidikan Di Era Digital Untuk Generasi Milenial, 1(1), 9. http://journal.um-surabaya.ac.id/index.php/Pro/article/view/4813

Al-Azzam, M. M., Hamadneh, B. M., Alqarni, T. M., & Almalki, A. D. (2023). The Degree of Using Blended Learning among Teachers of Students with Learning Disabilities. International Journal of Education in Mathematics, Science, and Technology (IJEMST), 11(6), 1443–1457. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.46328/ijemst.3761

Amboro, K. (2020). Kontekstualisasi Pandemi Covid-19 dalam Pembelajaran Sejarah. Yupa: Historical Studies Journal, 3(2), 90–106. https://doi.org/10.30872/yupa.v3i2.203

Arisoy, B., & Aybek, B. (2021). The effects of subject-based critical thinking education in mathematics on students' critical thinking skills and virtues*. Eurasian Journal of Educational Research, 2021(92), 99–120. https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2021.92.6

Armellini, A., Teixeira Antunes, V., & Howe, R. (2021). Student Perspectives on Learning Experiences in a Higher Education Active Blended Learning Context. TechTrends, 65(4), 433–443. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11528-021-00593-w

Arono, Arsyad, S., Syahriman, Nadrah, & Villia, A. S. (2022). Exploring the effect of digital literacy skill and learning style of students on their meta-cognitive strategies in listening. International Journal of Instruction, 15(1), 527–546. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2022.15130a

Ayasrah, S., Alnasraween, M. S., Alshorman, A., & Aljarrah, A. (2022). Attitudes of Teachers and Outstanding Students towards Blended Learning in Light of the Covid-19 Pandemic in Jordan. Pegem Egitim ve Ogretim Dergisi, 12(1), 249–255. https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.12.01.26

Bedebayeva, M., Grinshkun, V., Kadirbayeva, R., Zhamalova, K., & Suleimenova, L. (2022). A blended learning approach for teaching computer science in high schools. Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 17(7), 2235–2246. https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v17i7.7693

Bursa, S. (2023). the View of Prospective Social Studies Teachers on Blended Learning. Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education, 24(1), 185–199. https://doi.org/10.17718/tojde.1018486

Cleveland-Innes, M., & Wilton, D. (2018). Guide to Blended Learning. In The Commonwealth of Learning (COL) (Vol. 45). the Commonwealth of Learning.

Efendi, I., Prawitasari, M., & Susanto, H. (2021). Implementasi Penilaian Pembelajaran Pada Kurikulum 2013 Mata Pelajaran Sejarah. Prabayaksa: Journal of History Education, 1(1), 21. https://doi.org/10.20527/prb.v1i1.3081

Facione, P. a. (2015). Critical Thinking : What It Is and Why It Counts. In Insight assessment (Issue ISBN 13: 978-1-891557-07-1.). https://www.insightassessment.com/CT-Resources/Teaching-For-and-About-Critical-Thinking/Critical-Thinking-What-It-Is-and-Why-It-Counts/Critical-Thinking-What-It-Is-and-Why-It-Counts-PDF

Fadli, M. R., & Sudrajat, A. (2020). History Learning Module Based on Islamic Values on K.H. Hasyim Asy'ari's Jihad Resolution Material. Tadris: Jurnal Keguruan Dan Ilmu Tarbiyah, 5(1), 65–75. https://doi.org/10.24042/tadris.v5i1.5894

Fadli, M. R., Sudrajat, A., Aman, & Amboro, K. (2021). The influence of sorogan method in learning history to increase historical understanding and historical awareness. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education, 10(1), 300–307. https://doi.org/10.11591/IJERE.V10I1.20972

Fuller, L. (2021). Negotiating a New Blend in Blended Learning: Research Roots. Inquiry, 24(1), 5–7. https://commons.vccs.edu/inquiry

Graham, C. (2019). Current research in blended learning (4th ed., Issue April). Handbook of distance education.

Hasanah, & Malik, M. nasir. (2020). Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences. Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 15(5), 1295–1306. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v15i5.5168

Huang, X., & Chang, Y.-C. (2022). Critical Thinking Instruction Incorporated in Cross-Cultural Communication Course Design: A Needs Analysis Report Based on Voices of Chinese International College Undergraduates. Journal of Education and Learning, 12(1), 40. https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v12n1p40

Indra, R., Komariah, A., Nurdin, D., & Fadhli, R. (2022). A Rasch analysis: Comparing students' learning activity on online learning and blended learning. Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 17(6), 2013–2028. https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v17i6.7492

Katasila, P., & Poonpon, K. (2022). The Effects of Blended Learning Instruction on Vocabulary Knowledge of Thai Primary School Students. English Language Teaching, 15(5), 52. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v15n5p52

Kemaloglu, E., & Bayyurt, Y. (2022). Implementation of Blended Learning in English As a Lingua Franca (Elf)-Aware Pre-Service Teacher Education. Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education, 23(1), 60–73. https://doi.org/10.17718/tojde.1050353

Kizilhan, P., & Demir, E. (2022). A Study on the Relationship between Teacher Candidates' Attitudes towards Teaching Critical Thinking and Critical Thinking Standards. TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology, 21(4), 1–18. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6803-0183

Kobayashi, K., Kosuge, Y., & Akazawa, K. (2023). Blended Learning Effectiveness: Improving Japanese Medical Laboratory Science Students' Identification of Parasite Eggs. Journal of Education and Learning, 12(3), 26. https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v12n3p26

Kömür, İ. A., Kılınç, H., & Okur, R. (2023). The Rotation Model in Blended Learning. Asian Journal of Distance Education, 18(2), 63. http://www.asianjde.com/

Lin, X., & Gao, L. (2020). Students' Sense of Community and Perspectives of Taking Synchronous and Asynchronous Online Courses. Asian Journal of Distance Education, 15(1), 2020. http://www.asianjde.org

Lukitasari, M., Purnamasari, I., Utami, S., & Sukri, A. (2019). Blended-Problem-Based Learning: How its impact on students' critical thinking skills? JPBI (Jurnal Pendidikan Biologi Indonesia), 5(3), 425–434. https://doi.org/10.22219/jpbi.v5i3.10048

Maxwell, M. (2019). Historical Thinking Skills: A Second Opinion. Social Education, 83(5), 290–295.

Morais, E., Lopes, J., Silva, H., Dominguez, C., Payan-Carreira, R., Imaginário, C., & Santos, M. J. (2023). Dispositions toward Critical Thinking in Portuguese Undergraduate Students. Educational Process: International Journal, 12(1), 19–36. https://doi.org/10.22521/edupij.2023.121.2

Mutya, R. C., & Masuhay, A. R. L. (2023). the Extent of Implementation of Blended Learning in Senior High School Science Education Vis-a-Vis Students' Academic Achievement. Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education, 24(2), 47–63. https://doi.org/10.17718/tojde.1107412

Nguyen, H., Chambers, W., & Abbott, M. (2022). Building ESL Learners' Digital Literacy Skills Using Internet Memes. TESL Canada Journal, 39(1), 83–103. https://doi.org/10.18806/tesl.v39i1/1368

Noroozi, M. (2022). The Effect of Blended Learning Through Meaning-Focused Input and Output Activities on Learning Collocations. Mextesol Journal, 46(4).

Nurrijal, Setyosari, P., Kuswandi, D., & Ulfa, S. (2023). Creative Problem Solving Process Instructional Design in the Context of Blended Learning in Higher Education. Electronic Journal of E-Learning, 21(2), 80–97. https://doi.org/10.34190/ejel.21.2.2653

Orhan, A. (2023). Comparing the Effectiveness of Online, Flipped, and In-Class Critical Thinking Instruction on Critical Thinking Skills and Dispositions in Higher Education: Flipped Classroom Produces the Greatest Gains. International Journal of Technology in Education, 6(2), 238–259. https://doi.org/10.46328/ijte.376

Othman, F. A., & AL-Hileh, M. M. (2022). The Effect of Blended Learning in developing Critical Thinking Skills among 8 th grade Students in History Subject. Journal of Positive School Psychology, 2022(2), 2409–2428. http://journalppw.com

Patandung, Y. (2023). Adolescence Students' Critical Thinking Skills in The Context of Christian Education. International Journal of Asian Education, 4(3), 150–156. https://doi.org/10.46966/ijae.v4i3.349

Permana, R. (2020). Pembelajaran Sejarah Lokal di Sekolah (Syaharuddin & D. Tesniadi (eds.); 1st ed.). Media Edukasi Indonesia (Anggota IKAPI).

Pratama, R. A., Pratiwi, I. M., Saputra, M. A., & Sumargono. (2022). Integration of STEM education in history learning. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education, 11(1), 313–320. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v11i1.22064

Radulović, B., Dorocki, M., Ninković, S. O., Stojanović, M., & Adamov, J. (2023). the Effects of Blended Learning Approach on Student Motivation for Learning Physics. Journal of Baltic Science Education, 22(1), 73–82. https://doi.org/10.33225/jbse/23.22.73

Saputro, S. D., Tukiran, & Supardi, Z. A. I. (2022). Effectiveness of Clarity Learning Model to Improve Students' Advanced Clarification Critical Thinking Ability in Physics Courses. Pegem Egitim ve Ogretim Dergisi, 12(3), 44–48. https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.12.03.06

Setiawan, A. A., Muhtadi, A., & Hukom, J. (2022). Blended Learning and Student Mathematics Ability in Indonesia: A Meta-Analysis Study. International Journal of Instruction, 15(2), 905–916. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2022.15249a

Sopacua, J., Fadli, M. R., & Rochmat, S. (2020). The history learning module integrated character values. Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn), 14(3), 463–472. https://doi.org/10.11591/edulearn.v14i3.16139

Sutoyo, S., Agustini, R., & Fikriyati, A. (2023). Online Critical Thinking Cycle Model to Improve Pre-service Science Teacher's Critical Thinking Dispositions and Critical Thinking Skills. Pegem Egitim ve Ogretim Dergisi, 13(2), 173–181. https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.13.02.21

Suwarni, S. (2021). History Learning Uses Blended Learning. Socia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial, 18(2), 7–12.

Taşkıran, C., & Salur, M. (2021). Analysis of the Opinions of Social Studies Teachers on Digital Literacy Skills. In World Journal of Education (Vol. 11, Issue 2, p. 72). https://doi.org/10.5430/wje.v11n2p72

Temel, H. (2022). The Effect of Critical Thinking Course Carry Out with Distance Education on Critical Thinking Skills and Dispositions. International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies, 9(3), 792–808. https://doi.org/10.52380/ijpes.2022.9.3.894

Vachova, L., Sedlakova, E., & Kvintova, J. (2023). Academic Self-efficacy as a Precondition for Critical Thinking in University Students. Pegem Egitim ve Ogretim Dergisi, 13(2), 328–334. https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.13.02.36

Wei, L.-W. (2023). Needs Assessment Report Adopting a Mixed-Method Design: Chinese Postgraduates' Impressions of Critical Thinking Approach in Research Method Course. European Journal of English Language Teaching, 8(2), 91–112. https://doi.org/10.46827/ejel.v8i2.4775

Wuxue, J. (2023). The Influence of Optimized Blended Learning Mode on Learning Effectiveness for Higher Vocational College Students: A Quasi-Experimental Study in Higher Vocational College. TOJET : The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology, 22(2), 121–130.

Zahran, F. A. (2023). The Impact of ASSURE Model-Based Program on EFL in-Service Preparatory Teachers Teaching Skills and Digital Literacy Skills. International Journal of Research in Education and Science, 9(4), 937–950. https://doi.org/10.46328/ijres.3279