

Triangular Model of Socio-Economic and Psychological Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahmad¹, Dr. Sarfraz Khan², Dr. Fatima Sharif³, Allah Dad⁴

Abstract

The current study aims to examine the social, economic and the psychological well-being in the left behind elderly parents whose children have migrated to the other countries. The objectives of the study were to seek out the role of children migration in the left behind elderly people, to carve out how the migration of the children have influenced the psychological well-being in parents, to highlight the role of remittances in the economic well-being of the parents and to examine the reciprocal relationship among social, psychological and the economic well-being. The cross-sectional research design was used to measure the present construct. The study used questionnaire to collect the data. Researcher employed the multistage sampling technique to obtain the data from the 400 hundred parents whose children had migrated. The study concluded that high level of social well-being has the negative effect over the psychological well-being. Similarly, remittances from the children yield economic well-being in the elderly left behind parents.

The study suggested that there is need for institutional support from the state to enhance the social, psychological and the economic support for the elderly left behind parents.

Key Words: Well-being, Migration, Remittances.

1.Introduction

Well-being is an amalgamation of different elements that play significant role in the smooth and peaceful living of individuals. These elements include the life quality, sagacity, and an overall wellness. Well-being is based upon the yearning and personal choices of the individuals. It (well-being) can be both negative and positive according to the situation. Well-being is antonymous to ill-being that reflects the adverse situation (Kross et al., 2021). While the individual's perceptions, experiences, their understanding, the way they evaluate and value their lives is regarded as the subjective well-being. Physical well-being, psychological well-being, economic well-being, social well-being, and emotional well-being can be the further subdivisions of well-being. All these subdivisions are intermingled with each other and can affect the individuals both negatively and positively (Topp et al., 2015). In the milieu of well-being pleasure and happiness are treated as synonymous to each other while they bear different etymological and lexiconic backgrounds. Pleasure is the constituent element of well-being since it is exhibited as the experience lived well by the individuals. Moreover, other elements like,

1. Assistant Professor Higher Education Department, Govt. of Punjab

2. Assistant Professor, School of Sociology Quaid-I Azam University Islamabad

Assistant Professor, School of Economics Quaid-I Azam University Islamabad

(Corresponding Author : Dr. Fatima Sharif)

4. Assistant Director Field Operations(PHICP)Punjab Social Protection Authority

health, virtue, accomplishment of goals, realization of desires and attainment of knowledge, also contribute to well-being. On the other hand, happiness is also an integral part of well-being as it is comprehended as a symbol of satisfaction in an individual's life filled with pleasant feelings over unpleasant ones (Valkenburg, 2021).

The migration and its impacts have gained much attention from academia and policymakers. But the adverse effects of migration on those left behind have not attained much space within both circles (Wheeler, Fitzpatrick, and van der Geest 2022). The phenomenon of the elderly left behind and the migration of adults have not been explored to the level yet, that what are the factors pertaining to their lives that create the susceptibility and vulnerability among them. Similarly, the sufferings of the migrant's household have not been recorded at the higher level (Kharel et al. 2021). The focus of the research has been to determine the correlation between migration, demographic changes, and economic outcomes. The existing body of literature in the context of Asian society maps out that migration has been the source of better health indicators and the overall increased well-being of elderly people. Conversely, the studies have also recorded the adverse effects of migration as well as creating various challenges for the health care system of the country, which is sending more migrants to the outer countries (Lu, Zhang, and Du 2021 and (Suhardiman et al. 2021)).

Chen and Jiang (2019) established a longitudinal study from 1993 to 2013 in Pakistan to carve out the association between migration and well-being. It was revealed that the sentiments of stress and physical health had been indicated as outsourcing of subjective and objective well-being. Srivastava and Muhammad (2021) articulated that there is a strong relationship between overseas migration and the socio-economic aspects of the well-being of rural communities and households. Overall, the well-being of elderly people faces several challenges, like fluctuating stress.

The present study contributes to the academic sphere as this the study that has provided insights into the social, psychological and the economic well-being of elderly left behind. This is the novelty of the study that this mapped out the relationship between all the three well-being elements with reference to the elderly parents as they have not been studied earlier in the context of the Pakistani society. Along with this study have measured the reciprocal relationship between social, psychological and the economic well-being among elderly left behind parents.

2.1 Review of Literature

Guo et al. (2016) found no impact of child migration on the physical well-being of the elderly but found psychological impacts on a large scale as it leaves very few opportunities to see their children on daily bases. The migration of children leaves a serious impact on the mental health of parents, so they seek a serious focus by the government agencies on the mental and psychological well-being of the elderly left behind. Chuc et al. (2022) found the suicidal trends among the elderly in China due to various factors, including the children migration. The leading cause of suicide is the mental stress and loneliness. Ashfaq (2020) and Ariadi, Saud, and Ashfaq (2019) noted that parents live without their children in Pakistan and face various issues like sadness, loneliness, and stress. This stress is so serious that sometimes it agonizes them. Their

happiness coincides with the happiness of their children, the most important occasions are when their children visit them, but their happiness remains incomplete without the presence of their grandchildren. Ivlevs, Nikolova, and Graham (2019) explored that along with the economic benefits of family member migration, there are some negative impacts as well. Children's migration causes stress and anxiety among those left behind, especially the parents, but this stress and trauma situation is minimized in case the out-migration is towards the countries where it commonly takes place. (Yea 2022) and Shi (2022) Indicated the different health circumstances of their parents as in this qualitative research; it was indicated that the father of the certain migrant had been going through paralysis and other treatments. Dong et al. (2022) showed that the absence of elder children is harmful to the health of left-behind parents. Adult emigration might have effects on physical as well as mental stability. Studies also depicted that there is a positive association between the migrations of adult children and their left-behind parents.

Gassmann et al. (2013) claim that the unplanned and rapid migration of youth from Georgia without any formal organizational setup to provide social protection to the elderly is affecting elderly well-being on a large scale. It is true that there exists some system of elderly care in some countries like Mexico; still, migration is causing a different kind of transition for the elderly, and it is affecting their well-being negatively as they do not live as independent individuals anymore. Kanaiaupuni (2000) explain that migration can have differing consequences for elderly persons. For example, several studies conducted in Mexico have linked adult children s emigration to the deteriorating physical health of elderly individuals. They also found in Mexico that elderly persons with adult children living abroad were more likely to experience a heart attack or stroke and higher levels of self-reported health deterioration. Yang & Lertamornsak (2022) further suggests that elderly parents of migrants were more likely to experience deteriorating emotional health, which could potentially compound declining physical health. Feng, He, and Loh (2022) claim that the empty nest elderly in China is estimated to be up to 25% and this number is expected to reach 90% by 2030, so one of the most serious problems in social development China may face is elderly health care. They also observed that the number of females in non-empty nest households was higher than males, while the number of males in empty nest households was higher than the females. It is perhaps because of the hesitance male elderly feel while staying with their children. Female elderly also participates more in taking care of their grandchildren.

Guermond (2022) narrated remittances as a significant source of income for the growing economies, surpassing foreign direct investment for these countries. Remittances are more stable than various economic aids. They can exceed the national foreign reserves in many under-developed and developing countries like the countries in south Asia, including China, India, Pakistan, the Philippines, and Bangladesh. World Bank (2010) explains the statistical details about the migration, immigration, migrating population, remittances and the details regarding the host and source countries of the migration. According to these details, around 215 million people live as migrants, or three per cent of the world population lives as migrants. United States of America is among the favorite destination for migrants, along with Canada, Russia, Germany, Saudi Arabia, Qatar, and the United Arab Emirates, where the United States of America (USA) was the top destination for migrants from 2005 to 2010.

At the same time, the primary source countries include Ukraine, Russia, China, India, Bangladesh, and Pakistan. There were 232 million migrants all over the globe, and 207 million were above the age of 15 years (King-Dejardin 2019).

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 209

It is estimated that around four million Pakistanis migrate to other countries and live there. Around 50% of the total migrants live and work in United Arab Emirates, Kuwait, and Saudi Arabia. Europe hosts 28% of Pakistani migrants, while 21% are hosted by America and Canada. Shi (2022) the elderly population faces economic, health and psychological issues that hamper the concentration of the migrating youth and hinder their mobility. Liu (2022) revealed that the migration of children was related to the parent's depression at a low level. There are severe implications for the migration of the adult child because it includes the left behind of parents whose health status has been lowered.

3.1 Materials and Methods

To measure the well-being of elderly left behind a quantitative approach was used as it was the best way to approach maximum respondents and gather information. Lanitis, Taylor and Cootes (1999) introduced the parameterized statistical modeling to model face images of ageing. Pulkkinen and Simola (2000) suggested Bayesian modeling of repairable components of ageing models. Ghisletta and Aichele (2017) suggested different statistical techniques to model ageing data such as nonlinear mixed-effect model and generalized additive model. In addition to this, study especially focuses the aged population of the Rawalpindi district which is living alone or without their children. The study was conducted in Kallar Syedan tehsil of district Rawalpindi. For this purpose, Kallar Syedan was further subdivided into four circles and each circle was assigned a sample of 100. The elderly under study were taken from these tehsils on the following basis.

- a) They must have their child/children abroad.
- b) They must be residing the target area of the study
- c) They must be dependent upon their children
- d) They must have some economic dependence upon their children and have received foreign remittances.

The sample size was determined through the Taro Yamani formula was 399 but the researcher decided to collect the data from 440 respondents to cover any sort of missing data. The data was collected through the questionnaire using the multistage sampling technique.

4.1 Results & Analysis

Table 4.2 Psychological Well-Being

Variables Frequency Percentage PHQ9-cod

Mild 14 3.5 Moderate 237 59.3 Moderately Severe 108 27.0 Severe 41 10.3

Total 400 100

Psychological well-being was measured by using the PHQ-9 scale. The results show mild, moderate, moderately severe, and severe conditions of mental well-being. The respondents with mild symptoms are comparatively in lesser mental stress and have better psychological well-being than the rest of the respondents. The respondents with severe symptoms are at the lowest level of psychological well-being. These conditions of the respondents show the severity of mental stress they pass through daily. The respondents with mild stress levels were (3.5%), and those with moderate symptoms of stress were (59.3%). So, these two categories of respondents had better mental well-being than the rest of the respondents who had moderately severe and severe levels of stress. Respondents with moderately severe symptoms of stress were (27%), and the respondents with severe symptoms of stress were (10.3%). The respondents with severe symptoms of mental stress had the poorest psychological well-being. This group passed through panic attacks, hurting themselves and having suicidal thoughts and the few who attempted suicide were also from the same group. The causes behind the severe and moderately severe stress were multiple. The most prevalent reasons behind such mental conditions were loneliness, lack of care and attention, poor behavior (in some situations abusive) and disease. Lesser symptoms among the elderly who had a better social life and those who maintained their social life were much less stressed. The elderly who was more frequently engaged with their children, grandchildren and some businesses were also in much better mental condition. The respondents who used to spend more time performing religious rites faced a minor stress level. Most importantly, mental stress levels had nothing to do with economic well-being, and the respondents with plenty of money had the same or similar stress levels compared to those with poor economic well-being.

Table 4.3 Economic Well-being

Variables Frequency Percentage Eco_Cod

Low Economic 160 40.0 Medium Economic 196 49.0 High Economic 44 11.0

Total 400 100

Table above, elaborates the respondents' regarding their economic well-being. The table reflects that the respondents (40%) have low economic well-being. The respondents who fall in the category of those with a medium level of economic well-being were (49%). Of the respondents with a high level of economic well-being were (11%). Economic well-being was measured based on the income from agricultural land, commercial property, remittances, and the income from all the sources.

Hypothesis: the higher the number of children abroad of the elderly left behind, the lower the psychological health of the elderly left back.

Table 4.4: Tukey HSD Test: Difference in social, psychological and economic well-being by children living abroad

Dependent (J) How	variable (I) How many children live abroad	children live abroad Mean Difference	Std. Error	P
Psychological Health	many (I-J)	Four or above		
		One Child	<u>.31997</u>	<u>.43808</u>
		Two Children	<u>.31997</u>	<u>.43808</u>
		Three Children	<u>-1.11669</u>	<u>.63064</u>
		Four or above	<u>-3.45181*</u>	<u>1.24299</u>
		Children	<u>-3.13184*</u>	<u>1.21049</u>
		Two Children	<u>-1.43666</u>	<u>.69098</u>
		One Child	<u>-.31997</u>	<u>.43808</u>
		Four or above	<u>-2.01515</u>	<u>1.32318</u>
		Children	<u>-2.01515</u>	<u>1.32318</u>
		Three Children	<u>2.01515</u>	<u>1.32318</u>
		Children	<u>3.45181*</u>	<u>1.24299</u>
		One Child	<u>3.13184*</u>	<u>1.21049</u>
		Two	<u>1.21049</u>	<u>.049</u>
		Two	<u>1.32318</u>	<u>.425</u>

The psychological health of the elderly left behind whose four or above children are abroad is lower than that elderly left behind whose less than four children are abroad. In other words, the higher the number of children abroad of the elderly left behind, the lower the

psychological health of the elderly left behind. Hence the hypothesis is supported by data.

Table 4.5: Stepwise linear regression (SLR): Socio-psychological predictors of economic well-being

Variables	t	p	Beta	Standardized Coefficients
(Constant)	12.792	.000		
In gatherings, my friends discuss all types of issues that are being faced by us	.198	3.648	.000	Poor appetite or overeating .257 5.095 .000 I involve in welfare activities of the local community .806 6.927 .000 Number of Daughters -.135 -2.952 .003 What is your annual income from agricultural land -.107 -2.352 .019 I spend time at social gatherings with my neighborhood .272 4.296 .000 Arranging religious events -.194 -3.077 .002
I ask my friend(s) to take part in welfare activities planned by the organization/ committee	-.246	-3.333	.001	
I enjoy working for the community welfare	-.220	-2.223	.027	

The analysis generated 15 models of stepwise linear regression. Model 15, the last model, included all the significant variables. The above table shows the results of model 15. The model summary of all models is given below.

Table 4.6 : Model Summary of SLR to predict economic well-being Model R

R² Adj. R² S.E Est. F P

M1 .423 0.179 0.176 2.11746 70.242 0.00 M2 .485 0.236 0.231 2.04599 49.598 0.00

M3 .507 0.257 0.25 2.01959 37.093 0.00 M4 .558 0.311 0.303 1.94783 36.18 0.00

M5 .569 0.324 0.314 1.93258 30.616 0.00 M6 .579 0.335 0.323 1.91982 26.73 0.00

M7 .588 0.346 0.331 1.90774 23.922 0.00 M8 .596 0.355 0.338 1.89742 21.718 0.00

Model R R² Adj. R² S.E Est. F P M9 .603 0.364 0.346 1.88659 20.042 0.00 M10

.611 0.373 0.353 1.87675 18.659 0.00 M11 .608 0.37 0.352 1.87745 20.579 0.00

Migration Letters

214 Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

M12 .604 0.365 0.349 1.88227 22.707 0.00 M13 .611 0.373 0.355 1.87279 20.856

0.00 M14 .607 0.368 0.352 1.87756 23.019 0.00

M15 .615 0.378 0.36 1.86596 21.266 0.00

The R² of M15 showed that the data .615% of data fit the stepwise regression model, which showed that the model is highly reliable.

Table 4.7 : Stepwise linear regression (SLR): Psychological predictors of Social well-being

Model	t	p	Beta	Standardized Coefficients
(Constant)	29.196	.000		
Feeling bad about yourself — or that you are a failure or have let yourself or your family down	4.70	10.020	.000	Feeling tired or having little energy
	-.144	-2.419	.016	
Trouble falling or staying asleep, or sleeping too much	-.131	-2.209	.028	

Table 4.8 : Positively significant means social well-being is

high.

Model R R² Adj. R² S.E Est. F p M1 .486 .236 .233 17.14716 99.648 0.00

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 215

M2 .535 .286 .281 16.60177 64.437 0.00

M3 .545 .297 .290 16.50265 45.102 0.00

The R² of M3 showed that almost 30% of data fit the stepwise regression model. The fit index of the model is slightly lower it is because the model incorporated only three significant variables.

Table 4.9 : Stepwise linear regression (SLR): Socioeconomic predictors of psychological well-being

Variables	t	p	Beta	Standardized Coefficients
-----------	---	---	------	---------------------------

I sit with peers/friends .471 9.799 .000

My family encourages my participation in welfare

activities-.219 8.564 .000 I remain involved in resolving the conflicts in my area .534

15.736 .000

I am comfortable accepting both my good and bad

qualities.354 9.339 .000

I use my mobile phone to interact with my children when

-.197 -5.203 .000

they are away from home

I use a mobile phone -.344 11.696 .000 I spend

time watching television .278 8.895 .000

Migration Letters

216 Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

I can deal with whatever comes my way. .062 2.279 .023 My family involves me in

household decision making .201 6.303 .000

In difficult times, I develop mental toughness in dealing

with the situation-.177 -6.051 .000

The organization in which I am engaged values my

services-.200 3.473 .001 Engagement in income generation activities .149 4.369 .000

Share sorrows and griefs that happened in my

neighborhood-.212 -5.598 .000 Arranging social events .235 5.429 .000 Engagement in

political activities -.288 -6.454 .000 I discuss political issues with my friends -.212 -6.819

.000

Standardized
Variables **Coefficients† P**

My neighbors help me whenever I need them .098 2.935 .004 I advise my children
whenever I feel they needed -.116 -2.901 .004 My friends play games with me .142 4.076

.000

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 217

My friends send me gifts .249 5.394 .000 I remain in contact with my friends by using social

media -.325 -5.785 .000 Take part in resolving mosque/church-related issues .133 2.600 .010

I ask my friend(s) to take part in welfare activities

planned by the organization/ committee .087 2.188 .029

The analysis generated 25 models of stepwise linear regression. Model 25, the last model, included all the significant variables. The above table shows the results of model 25. The model summary of all models is given below.

Table 4.10 : Model Summary of SLR to predict psychological well-being Model R

R² Adj. R² S.E Est. F p

M1 .581 0.337 0.335 2.77107 164.455 .000 M2 .668 0.446 0.443 2.53713 129.746 .000

M3 .739 0.546 0.542 2.30139 128.573 .000 M4 .824 0.678 0.674 1.93956 168.749 .000

M5 .840 0.705 0.7 1.86046 152.481 .000 M6 .854 0.729 0.724 1.78617 142.539 .000 M7

.867 0.752 0.746 1.71235 137.082 .000 M8 .881 0.775 0.77 1.6315 136.278 .000

Migration Letters

218 *Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents*

M9 .890 0.793 0.787 1.56973 133.786 .000 M10 .899 0.808 0.802 1.51319 132.071 .000

M11 .907 0.823 0.817 1.45435 132.425 .000 M12 .910 0.829 0.822 1.43432 125.619 .000

M13 .914 0.835 0.828 1.41077 120.746 .000 M14 .916 0.838 0.831 1.39718 114.818 .000

M15 .920 0.847 0.839 1.36353 113.618 .000 M16 .924 0.854 0.847 1.3313 112.744 .000

M17 .927 0.859 0.851 1.31167 109.919 .000 M18 .929 0.862 0.854 1.29857 106.317 .000

M19 .930 0.865 0.857 1.28743 102.805 .000 M20 .933 0.871 0.863 1.25974 102.734 .000

M21 .934 0.873 0.864 1.25154 99.366 .000 M22 .938 0.88 0.872 1.21707 101.134 .000

M23 .938 0.88 0.871 1.21972 105.38 .000

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 219

M24 .939 0.882 0.873 1.21078 102.331 .000 M25 .940 0.884 0.875 1.20326 99.317 .000

The R2 of M25 showed that 88% of the data fit the stepwise regression model, which shows that the model is highly reliable.

Log-Linear Model of Homogenous Association

Table 4.11: Model selection Criteria

Model Selection Criteria

Mode

$p(\chi^2)$

Constructed Models

	G^2	χ^2	Df	AIC	BIC	$p(G^2)$
	23.58	24				<.05
	17.68	7				<.05
M1	25.68	7				2.5516

M2	M1 + 1.245	1.26	1	-0.755	-4.538	<.05	<.05	$\lambda_{11}^{SW,PW} + \lambda_{12}^{SW,EW} + \lambda_{12}^{PW,EW}$
M3	M2 + 1.49			27.42	9			
	1.538	5	-8.51	-		<.05	<.05	

Note: SW = Social Wellbeing, PW = Psychological Wellbeing, EW = Economic Wellbeing
 AIK and BIC values are satisfactory. M2 is a simplified model. Log-Linear Model of Homogeneous Association.

4.12 Discussion of the log-linear model of the study.

There is an extant breadth of literature on the modelling of well-being with reference to elderly people. Somehow only a few studies have quantified well-being that has focused either on psychological well-being or social or economic well-being. Correspondingly, the present log-linear model endows insights into the social, psychological and economic aspects predicting the well-being of the elderly left behind owing to the migration of their adults. This is a unique contribution with respect to the elderly left behind in Pakistan. Furthermore, the underlined quantified model shows that there is reciprocity between the constructs. Meanwhile, the model unfolds that there is a positive association between

Migration Letters

220 *Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents*

economic and social well-being. The spike in economic well-being posits an increase in social well-being and vice versa.

On the contrary, the model elucidates through its findings that there exists no association between economic and psychological well-being. While it has appeared that there is a negative association between psychological well-being and social well-being. Respondents with more social engagements, interactions and relations tend to show lower psychological well-being.

4.13 Hypotheses:

1. Social and psychological well-being are reciprocally associated among elderly left behind persons. (Supported by data)
2. Economic and social well-being are reciprocally associated with each other among elderly left behind persons (Supported by data)
3. Psychological and economic well-being are reciprocally associated among elderly left behind persons (Not Supported by data).

Table 4.14 : Parameter estimates of M2

Parameter B S.E. Z p Social Wellbeing -1.470 .371 -3.961 .000 Psychological Well-being

1.326 .239 5.544 .000 Economic Well-being .413 .268 1.539 .124 High Social Wellbeing*

High Psychological Wellbeing -.954 .296 -3.219 .001 High Social Wellbeing * High

Economic Wellbeing 1.243 .357 3.483 .000 High Psychological Wellbeing * High

Economic Wellbeing .146 .293 .498 .618

Constant 2.971 .216 13.781 .000

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 221

First, two hypotheses have been accepted and validated by the results of the Log-Linear Model of homogeneous Association (Table 4.35 Shows the Results). High social well being and high psychological well-being are inversely associated with each other. It means that high engagement in social life affects the psychological well-being of the elderly left behind. If the elderly has high psychological well-being will affect their social well-being negatively. In the second hypothesis, we see that high social well-being has a positive impact on the economic well-being of the left-behind elderly. Similarly, high economic well-being affects social well-being positively. Hence it reflects that a justified method has been used in the current research, and the proposed model using the Log Linear Model of Homogeneous Association fits the data. It can be generalized for further study in the field of left-behind elderly well-being. The third hypothesis is not supported; hence the hypothesis reflects that there is no association between the economic and psychological well-being of the group under study.



Figure 6. 1: Graphical Representation of the Model

5.1 Discussion

Present study finds out the association among social well-being, psychological well-being and economic wellbeing. High level of social well-being negatively affects the psychological well-being. While a healthy social well-being produces a strong economic wellbeing and vice versa. These findings are contradictory with the three studies conducted earlier in Mexico and USA by (Li and Tang 2022) and (Kuhn et al. 2011). Correspondingly, Gierveld, Dykstra, and Schenk (2012) put forward the correlation between well-being and migration regarding the left behind. It framed out that social networks impact the lives of those left behind if they replace and play the roles of the migrated individuals. Similarly, the current venture unfolds that the relatives and the neighborhood are associated with the well-being of the elderly left behind in favorable term. The difference in findings may be due to the cultural settings, as in Pakistan it is an obligation for the children to take care of their parents and in absence of children and their care the parents face criticism by the people in the surroundings on sending their children abroad for the sake of money. This criticism causes stress and depression for left-behind parents.

Migration Letters

222 Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

Eventually, Thapa et al. (2018) remarked that the elderly left behind parents had become prey to mental ailments compared to the non-left behind elderly parents. The same findings have appeared in our present tridimensional model of well-being. It has illustrated that the parents have been found with higher level symptoms of mental health retardation. This study has a similarity in loneliness and depression, and poor psychological health with the integrated review. In line with this, Fokkema, De Jong Gierveld, and Dykstra (2012) presented a negative correlation between emotional and social loneliness in Dutch women. Additionally, the nature of contact between the parents and the adult lowers the depression level in elderly parents. Meanwhile, our study depicted that depression and loneliness are ushered in parents owing to the lower frequency of contact with their children. Kuhn et al. (2011) captioned that there is a negative effect on the elderly self-rated health, daily living,

and the morality of the parents in Indonesia. While in our study, these results endorsed that their out-migration is correlated with parents' daily life activities. Furthermore, the present study established that there is a high frequency of social contact; social support and social interaction have been found among those who have better economic well-being than others. This is contrary to the study by Hommadova Lu and Mejova (2022), who found that social interaction and perceived social support (Szkody et al., 2021) have been negatively correlated with loneliness. Furthermore, our study digs out that there is a strong relationship between the remittances (economic well-being) and the overall health and well-being of the empty nest parents. Consequently, the same has been claimed by Adhikari et al. (2011) and Graham and Jordan (2011). On the contrary, Heymann et al. (2009) argument reflects no association between migration and improved economic well-being. In the South Asian context, culture is firmly embedded in all spheres of life. Here, the parents expect financial support along with other support like emotional and physical from their adult migrants (Mui and Kang 2006). Consequently, in the present quantitative modelling, it has been revealed that parents desire substantial economic benefits from their children. Cai, Park, and Yip (2022) captioned that although Chinese parents have been a prey to psychological issues, these issues can be tackled with the economic gains of children. The rationale here persists that the economic values determine the other life aspects in Asian societies. The same findings have been endorsed by our study as it unveils those economic well-being influences the lives of the parents to a greater extent. Nevertheless, the findings postulated by the present study have affirmed the standpoint of the previous research ventures, which indicated the importance and the gaps that have been studied in the present Pakistani culture.

5.2 Conclusion

According to most of the respondents, they were not involved in any kind of economic activity resultantly they were dependent on their children. A few respondents still had a control on their business, and they had not yet handed over the business to their children as well as they had not distributed their inheritance. It is commonly believed that the having control on property and business provides security to the elderly in terms of care by children. It was also found that governmental departments play an ignorable role in elderly care especially the left-behind. The study finds no correlation between economic and psychological and a positive correlation between economic and social well-being. As well as a negative correlation between psychological and social wellbeing.

5.3 Limitations and directions for the future studies

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 223

The study has been conducted in the one tehsil of the Punjab province. Future studies can take into consideration respondents from all the provinces of Pakistan. In addition to this the social, economic and the psychological well-being can be studied with the social inequalities with respect to the elderly left behind parents in Pakistan.

References

- Adhikari, Ramesh, Aree Jampaklay, and Aphichat Chamrathirong. 2011. "Impact of Children's Migration on Health and Health Care-Seeking Behavior of Elderly Left Behind." *BMC Public Health* 11:1–8. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-11-143.
- Ariadi, Septi, Muhammad Saud, and Asia Ashfaq. 2019. "Analyzing the Effect of Remittance Transfer on Socioeconomic Well-Being of Left-Behind Parents: A Study of Pakistan and Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK)." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 20(3):809–21. doi: 10.1007/s12134-018-0632-7.

Ashfaq, Asia. 2020. "The Effects of Global Migration of Male Children on Left-behind Parents' Family and Social Life: The Case of Pakistan." *Masyarakat, Kebudayaan Dan Politik* 244 33(4):352. doi: 10.20473/mkp.v33i42020.352-363.

Assim, Mohamad Ibrani Shahrinin Adam, Agilan Munusamy, Yasmin Yacob, Nurul Hidayu Mat Jusoh, and Salina Janis. 2021. "Factors Influencing Psychological Well-Being and Gender Among Private Financial Sector Employees in Malaysia." *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* 11(3). doi: 10.6007/ijarbss/v11- i3/8947.

Chen, Xiaojin, and Xin Jiang. 2019. "Are Grandparents Better Caretakers? Parental Migration, Caretaking Arrangements, Children's Self-Control, and Delinquency in Rural China." *Crime and Delinquency* 65(8):1123–48. doi: 10.1177/0011128718788051.

Chuc, Anh Tu, Weiqing Li, Nguyet Thi Minh Phi, Quoc Tuan Le, Naoyuki Yoshino, and Farhad Taghizadeh-Hesary. 2022. "The Necessity of Financial Inclusion for Enhancing the Economic Impacts of Remittances." *Borsa Istanbul Review* 22(1):47–56. doi: 10.1016/j.bir.2020.12.007.

Cromhout, Amanda, Lusilda Schutte, Marié P. Wissing, and Willem D. Schutte. 2022. "Further Investigation of the Dimensionality of the Questionnaire for Eudaimonic Well-Being." *Frontiers in Psychology* 13(May):1–15. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2022.795770.

De Kock, Johannes H., Helen Ann Latham, Stephen J. Leslie, Mark Grindle, Sarah Anne Munoz, Liz Ellis, Rob Polson, and Christopher M. O'Malley. 2021. "A Rapid Review of the Impact of COVID-19 on the Mental Health of Healthcare Workers: Implications for Supporting Psychological Well-Being." *BMC Public Health* 21(1):1–18. doi: 10.1186/s12889-020- 10070-3.

Dong, Lijing, Zhanhua Jia, Lingyu Zhang, and Shaohua Wang. 2022. "Obstacle Factors and Spatial Measurement of the Well-Being of the Elderly in China." *Sustainability (Switzerland)* 14(4):1–15. doi: 10.3390/su14041950.

Feng, Qundi, Qinying He, and Chung Ping A. Loh. 2022. "The Effect of Childhood Left-behind Experience on Individual's Income: Evidence from China." *Applied Economics* 00(00):1– 14. doi: 10.1080/00036846.2022.2042465.

Gassmann, Franziska, Melissa Siegel, Michaela Vanore, and Jennifer Waidler. 2013. "UNU - MERIT Working Paper Series: The Impact of Migration on Children Left behind in Moldova." (31):3–32.

Ghisletta, Paolo, and Stephen Aichele. 2017. "Quantitative Methods in Psychological Aging Research: A Mini-Review." *Gerontology* 63(6):529–37. doi: 10.1159/000477582.

Migration Letters

224 Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

Giacalone, Massimiliano, Raffaele Mattera, and Eugenia Nissi. 2022. "Socio-Economic Planning Sciences Well-Being Analysis of Italian Provinces with Spatial Principal Components." *Socio Economic Planning Sciences (November 2021)*:101377. doi: 10.1016/j.seps.2022.101377.

Giangrasso, Barbara. 2021. "Psychometric Properties of the PERMA-Profilier as Hedonic and Eudaimonic Well-Being Measure in an Italian Context." *Current Psychology* 40(3):1175– 84. doi: 10.1007/s12144-018-0040-3.

Guermond, Vincent. 2022. "Whose Money? Digital Remittances, Mobile Money and Fintech in Ghana." *Journal of Cultural Economy* 0(0):1–16. doi: 10.1080/17530350.2021.2018347.

Guo, Y. Q., C. C. Zhang, H. Huang, X. Zheng, X. J. Pan, and J. Z. Zheng. 2016. "Mental Health and Related Influencing Factors among the Empty-Nest Elderly and the Non-Empty-Nest Elderly in

Taiyuan, China: A Cross-Sectional Study.” *Public Health* 141(56):210–17. doi: 10.1016/j.puhe.2016.09.005.

Huang, Guogui, Yuanyuan Duan, Fei Guo, and Gong Chen. 2020. “Prevalence and Related Influencing Factors of Depression Symptoms among Empty-Nest Older Adults in China.” *Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics* 91(June):104183. doi: 10.1016/j.archger.2020.104183.

Ivlevs, Artjoms, Milena Nikolova, and Carol Graham. 2019. Emigration, Remittances, and the Subjective Well-Being of Those Staying Behind. Vol. 32. *Journal of Population Economics*.

Kharel, Madhu, Shibanuma Akira, Junko Kiriya, Ken Ing Cherng Ong, and Masamine Jimba. 2021. “Parental Migration and Psychological Wellbeing of Left-behind Adolescents in Western Nepal.” *PLoS ONE* 16(1 January):1–13. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0245873. King-Dejardin, Amelita. 2019. *The Social Construction of Migrant Work: At the Intersection of Care, Migration and Gender*.

Kross, Ethan, Philippe Verduyn, Gal Sheppes, Cory K. Costello, John Jonides, and Oscar Ybarra. 2021. “Social Media and Well-Being: Pitfalls, Progress, and Next Steps.” *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 25(1):55–66. doi: 10.1016/j.tics.2020.10.005.

Kusier, Amalie Oxholm, and Anna Paldam Folker. 2021. “The Satisfaction with Life Scale: Philosophical Foundation and Practical Limitations.” *Health Care Analysis* 29(1):21–38. doi: 10.1007/s10728-020-00420-y.

Lanitis, Andreas, Chris J. Taylor, and Timothy F. Cootes. 1999. “Modeling the Process of Ageing in Face Images.” *Proceedings of the IEEE International Conference on Computer Vision* 1:131–36. doi: 10.1109/iccv.1999.791208.

Lefebvre, Jade Isis, Francesco Montani, François Courcy, and Véronique Dagenais-Desmarais. 2021. “Self-Compassion at Work: A Key for Enhancing Well-Being and Innovation through Social Safeness at Multiple Levels.” *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences* 38(4):398–413. doi: 10.1002/cjas.1599.

Liu, Yuandong. 2022. “Analysis Of Loneliness And Mental Health Of Rural Left-Behind Analysis Of The Influence Of Ideological And Political Education On College Students ’ Communication And Adaptation Barriers.” 34:71–72.

Lu, Yao, Ruochen Zhang, and Haifeng Du. 2021. “Family Structure, Family Instability, and Child Psychological Well-Being in the Context of Migration: Evidence From Sequence Analysis in China.” *Child Development* 92(4):e416–38. doi: 10.1111/cdev.13496.

Luhmann, Maike, Louise C. Hawkley, Michael Eid, and John T. Cacioppo. 2012. “Time Frames and the Distinction between Affective and Cognitive Well-Being.” *Journal of Research in Personality* 46(4):431–41. doi: 10.1016/j.jrp.2012.04.004.

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Ahamd et al. 225

Luhmann, Maike, Louise C. Hawkley, Michael Eid, and John T. Cacioppo. 2012. “Time Frames and the Distinction between Affective and Cognitive Well-Being.” *Journal of Research in Personality* 46(4):431–41. doi: 10.1016/j.jrp.2012.04.004.

Luo, Ruzhen, Chunmei Zhang, and Yanhui Liu. 2020. “Health Risk Assessment Indicators for the Left-behind Elderly in Rural China: A Delphi Study.” *International Journal of 258 Environmental Research and Public Health* 17(1). doi: 10.3390/ijerph17010340.

Luo, Ruzhen, Chunmei Zhang, and Yanhui Liu. 2020. “Health Risk Assessment Indicators for the Left-behind Elderly in Rural China: A Delphi Study.” *International Journal of 258 Environmental*

Research and Public Health 17(1). doi: 10.3390/ijerph17010340.

Mahlo, Leeann, and Tim D. Windsor. 2021. "Older and More Mindful? Age Differences in Mindfulness Components and Well-Being." *Aging and Mental Health* 25(7):1320–31. doi: 10.1080/13607863.2020.1734915.

McGuire, Joel, Caspar Kaiser, and Anders M. Bach-Mortensen. 2022. "A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Impact of Cash Transfers on Subjective Well-Being and Mental Health in Low and Middle-Income Countries." *Nature Human Behavior* 6(3):359–70. doi: 10.1038/s41562-021-01252-z.

Oliver, Mary Beth. 2022. "Social Media Use and Eudaimonic Well-Being." *Current Opinion in Psychology* 45:101307. doi: 10.1016/j.copsyc.2022.101307.

Pentikäinen, Emmi, Anni Pitkämä, Sini Tuuli Siponkoski, Maarit Jansson, Jukka Louhivuori, Julene K. Johnson, Teemu Paajanen, and Teppo Särkämö. 2021. "Beneficial Effects of Choir Singing on Cognition and Well-Being of Older Adults: Evidence from a Cross Sectional Study." *PLoS ONE* 16(2 February):1–14. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0245666.

Pulkkinen, U., and K. Simola. 2000. "Bayesian Models and Ageing Indicators for Analyzing Random Changes in Failure Occurrence." *Reliability Engineering and System Safety* 68(3):255–68. doi: 10.1016/S0951-8320(00)00020-X.

Račaitė, Justina, Jutta Lindert, Khatia Antia, Volker Winkler, Rita Sketerskienė, Marija Jakubauskienė, Linda Wulkau, and Genė Šurkienė. 2021. "Parent Emigration, Physical Health and Related Risk and Preventive Factors of Children Left behind: A Systematic Review of Literature." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 18(3):1–15. doi: 10.3390/ijerph18031167.

Shawn Malia Kanaiaupuni. 2000. "Center for Demography and Ecology ,Leaving Parents Behind :Migration and Elderly Living Arrangements in Mexico." (99).

Shi, Xinjie. 2022. "Moving out but Not for the Better: Health Consequences of Interprovincial Rural-Urban Migration in China." *Health Economics (United Kingdom)* 31(4):555–73. doi: 10.1002/hec.4468.

Simpson, Julija, Viviana Albani, Zoe Bell, Clare Bamba, and Heather Brown. 2021. "Effects of Social Security Policy Reforms on Mental Health and Inequalities: A Systematic Review of Observational Studies in High-Income Countries." *Social Science and Medicine* 272(January). doi: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2021.113717.

Srivastava, Shobhit, and T. Muhammad. 2021. "In Pursuit of Happiness: Changes in Living Arrangement and Subjective Well-Being among Older Adults in India." *Journal of Population Ageing*. doi: 10.1007/s12062-021-09327-5.

Migration Letters

226 Triangulation Modelling Of Social, Psychological And The Economic Well-Being Among Left Behind Parents

Suhardiman, Diana, Jonathan Rigg, Marcel Bandur, Melissa Marschke, Michelle Ann Miller, Noudsavanh Pheuangsavanh, Mayvong Sayatham, and David Taylor. 2021. "On the Coattails of Globalization: Migration, Migrants and COVID-19 in Asia." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 47(1):88–109. doi: 10.1080/1369183X.2020.1844561.

Taris, Toon, and Wilmar Schaufeli. 2015. "Well-Being and Performance at Work: A Conceptual and Theoretical Overview." *Well-Being and Performance at Work The Role of Context* 15–34. Topp, Christian Winther, Søren Dinesen Østergaard, Susan Søndergaard, and Per Bech. 2015. "The WHO-5 Well-Being Index: A Systematic Review of the Literature." *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics* 84(3):167–76. doi: 10.1159/000376585.

Valkenburg, Patti M. 2022. "Social Media Use and Well-Being: What We Know and What We Need to Know." *Current Opinion in Psychology* 45:101294. doi: 10.1016/j.copsyc.2021.12.006. Wheeler, Brittany L., Juno Fitzpatrick, and Kees van der Geest. 2022. "The Ongoingness of Migration: Marshallese Well-Being in the United States." *Journal of Disaster Research* 17(3):335– 45. doi: 10.20965/jdr.2022.p0335.

Wojcik, Sebastian. 2015. "Individual and Community Well-Being in Transborder Areas : Spatial Patterns and Regional Accounts – an Exercise from Poland and Ukraine." (January).

Yea, Sallie. 2022. "Transnationalism Unstuck: Precarious Work and the Transnational Geographies of Failed Migration of Bangladeshi Migrant Workers in Singapore." *Global Networks* 22(2):259–73. doi: 10.1111/glob.12343.

Zhang, Yan. 2020. "Are Empty-Nest Elders Unhappy? Re-Examining Chinese Empty-Nest Elders' Subjective Well-Being Considering Social Changes." *Frontiers in Psychology* 11(May):1–12. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00885.

Yang, M., & Lertamornsak, G. (2022, August). A study on the Educational Management of left behind Children in Rural areas. In *รายงานการประชุม Graduate School Conference* (Vol. 4, No. 1, p. 822).